

LIVERMORE AMADOR VALLEY TRANSIT AUTHORITY
1362 Rutan Court, Suite 100
Livermore, CA 94551

PROJECTS and SERVICES COMMITTEE MEETING / COMMITTEE OF THE
WHOLE

COMMITTEE MEMBERS

SCOTT HAGGERTY
DAVID HAUBERT

KARLA BROWN – VICE CHAIR
STEVEN SPEDOWFSKI – CHAIR

DATE: Monday, September 24, 2018

PLACE: Diana Lauterbach Room LAVTA Offices
1362 Rutan Court, Suite 100, Livermore

TIME: 4:00p.m.

AGENDA

1. Call to Order and Pledge of Allegiance

2. Roll Call of Members

3. Meeting Open to Public

- Members of the audience may address the Committee on any matter within the general subject matter jurisdiction of the LAVTA Board of Directors.
- Members of the audience may address the Committee on items on the Agenda at the time the Chair calls for the particular Agenda item.
- Public comments should not exceed three (3) minutes.
- Agendas are published 72 hours prior to the meeting.
- No action may be taken on matters raised that are not on the Agenda.

4. Minutes of the August 27, 2018 Meeting of the P&S Committee.

Recommendation: Approval

5. Final Staff Proposed Fare Policy Changes

Recommendation: Staff recommends the Projects and Services Committee forward the final staff proposed fare policy changes to the Board of Directors for consideration, and recommends that the Board approve these proposed changes with an implementation date of January 1, 2019.

6. 2018 FTA Triennial Review

Recommendation: Review the 2018 FTA Triennial report.

7. Management Action Plan (MAP)

Recommendation: None – information only.

8. Preview of Upcoming P&S Committee Agenda Items

9. Matters Initiated by Committee Members

10. Next Meeting Date is Scheduled for: October 22, 2018

11. Adjourn

Please refrain from wearing scented products (perfume, cologne, after-shave, etc.) to these meetings, as there may be people in attendance susceptible to environmental illnesses.

In the event that a quorum of the entire Board is present, this Committee shall act as a Committee of the Whole. In either case, any item acted upon by the Committee or the Committee of the Whole will require consideration and action by the full Board of Directors as a prerequisite to its legal enactment.

I hereby certify that this agenda was posted 72 hours in advance of the noted meeting.

/s/ Jennifer Suda

9/20/18

LAVTA Administrative Services Department

Date

On request, the Livermore Amador Valley Transit Authority will provide written agenda materials in appropriate alternative formats, or disability-related modification or accommodation, including auxiliary aids or services, to enable individuals with disabilities to participate in public meetings. A written request, including name of the person, mailing address, phone number and brief description of the requested materials and preferred alternative format or auxiliary aid or service should be sent at least seven (7) days before the meeting. Requests should be sent to:

*Executive Director
Livermore Amador Valley Transit Authority
1362 Rutan Court, Suite 100
Livermore, CA 94551
Fax: 925.443.1375
Email : frontdesk@lavta.org*

AGENDA

ITEM 4



MINUTES OF THE AUGUST 27, 2018
LAVTA PROJECTS AND SERVICES COMMITTEE MEETING

1. Call to Order and Pledge of Allegiance

Committee Chair Steven Spedowfski called the meeting to order at 4:00pm.

2. Roll Call of Members

Members Present

Scott Haggerty, Supervisor, Alameda County
Jerry Pentin, Councilmember, City of Pleasanton
Steven Spedowfski, Councilmember, City of Livermore

Members Absent

David Haubert, Mayor, City of Dublin
Karla Brown, Councilmember, City of Pleasanton

3. Meeting Open to Public

Robert S. Allen

Robert Allen requested for south bound buses to stop and pick-up passengers at the stop sign by the fare gates at BART.

4. Minutes of the June 25, 2018 Meeting of the P&S Committee.

Approved: Haggerty/Pentin

Aye: Pentin, Haggerty, Spedowfski

No: None

Abstain: None

Absent: Haubert, Brown

5. Contract Award for On-Call Creative, Design and Media Strategy Services

Staff provided the Projects and Services Committee the contract award for on-call creative, design and media strategy services. The Projects and Services Committee requested staff to bring the recommendation back to this committee meeting and include score sheets from the evaluation team and examples of creative and design work included in the proposals of the two highest ranked proposers. LAVTA issued a request for proposals (RFP) in April and received three responses. The proposals came from MHD Group, Inc., O'Rorke Inc., and Celtis Ventures, Inc. LAVTA evaluated the proposals and is requesting the contract to be awarded to Celtis Ventures, Inc.

The item was discussed by the Projects and Services Committee.

The Projects and Services Committee forwarded without a recommendation to the LAVTA Board the award of contract for On-Call Creative, Design and Media

Strategy Services to Celtis Ventures, Inc. for an initial two year term with three one-year options.

Approved: Pentin/Spedowfski
Aye: Pentin, Haggerty, Spedowfski
No: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Haubert, Brown

6. Fixed Route Passenger Satisfaction Survey 2018

Staff provided data on the latest Fixed Route survey results that were focused on trunk routes #10 and #30, but also included the shorter local routes. The survey was conducted during the month of May and June 2018 and LAVTA received 400 responses to the survey. LAVTA's average scoring across all quality-of-service was 4.35; the same as last year. The area that was rated the highest (4.6) was regarding feeling safe when riding the bus, while the lowest (4.0) was in the area of whether services operate on time. LAVTA received 259 open-ended comments from respondents covering a large variety of topics. Some commenters focused on the perceived lack of timely service, drivers being discourteous or rude, frustration with weekend service, and issues about system/network connectivity and frequency. Staff informed that the results of the survey will be used to assess areas together with LAVTA's contractor, so that we can improve and it will go into the overall calculation of penalties and incentives of the operations contract.

The item was discussed by the Projects and Services Committee. Committee Members Jerry Pentin and Scott Haggerty are concerned about rude drivers and requested LAVTA to work with MV to resolve this immediately. Committee Member Jerry Pentin would like LAVTA to have a phone app for people over 25 and to ask in the survey what they do. Committee Member Scott Haggerty also requested a sub-analysis of the late complaints.

This was informational only.

7. Memorandum of Understanding between the City of Dublin and the Livermore Amador Valley Transit Authority for the Shared Autonomous Vehicle Testing Project.

The Projects and Services Committee recommend the approval of the memorandum of understanding between LAVTA and the City of Dublin to the Board of Directors.

Approved: Pentin/Haggerty
Aye: Pentin, Haggerty, Spedowfski
No: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Haubert, Brown

8. BART Early-Morning Service Plan and Bus Bridge

Staff provided the BART Early-Morning Service Plan and Bus Bridge to the Projects and Services Committee. Staff informed that BART would require two LAVTA buses that would provide two roundtrips for 3 ½ years to assist BART with their multi-year program to rehabilitate aging infrastructure. BART will fully compensate LAVTA for the service. To keep things simple LAVTA would be able to apply its own local fare, the revenues from which would be credited back to BART.

The item was discussed by the Projects and Services Committee. The Projects and Services Committee requested that a clause be added that states “LAVTA will make observations to make sure no one is being left behind and if so we have the ability to expand the service. BART would reimburse LAVTA for doing observations and administrative time tracking this service”.

The Projects and Services Committee approved in concept the request by the BART District for LAVTA to operate an early-morning bus bridge route on weekdays between the East Dublin / Pleasanton and Bay Fair stations, and direct staff to negotiate a draft agreement with BART District that fully compensates LAVTA for the additional services rendered. It is anticipated that the draft agreement would be considered by the LAVTA Board at a future meeting.

Approved: Spedowfski/Pentin
Aye: Pentin, Haggerty, Spedowfski
No: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Haubert, Brown

9. Renaming of the Wheels Accessible Advisory Committee (WAAC)

The Projects and Services approved renaming the Wheels Accessible Advisory Committee (WAAC) to Tri-Valley Accessible Advisory Committee (TAAC), and forward this recommendation to the LAVTA Board of Directors.

Approved: Haggerty/Pentin
Aye: Pentin, Haggerty, Spedowfski
No: None
Abstain: None
Absent: Haubert, Brown

10. Management Action Plan (MAP)

Executive Director Michael Tree provided the Projects and Services Committee the Management Action Plan (MAP). Executive Director Michael Tree briefly noted some website upgrades for choice riders, application development, and rebranding bus stop signs. Executive Director Michael Tree will provide a future update on school tripper route improvements.

This was informational only.

11. Preview of Upcoming P&S Committee Agenda Items

12. Matters Initiated by Committee Members

None.

13. Next Meeting Date is Scheduled for: September 24, 2018

14. Adjourn

Meeting adjourned at 4:55pm.

AGENDA

ITEM 5



S T A F F R E P O R T

SUBJECT: Final Staff Proposed Fare Policy Changes

FROM: Tony McCaulay, Director of Planning and Marketing

DATE: September 24, 2018

Action Requested

Staff recommends the Projects and Services Committee forward the final staff proposed fare policy changes to the Board of Directors for consideration, and recommends that the Board approve these proposed changes with an implementation date of January 1, 2019.

Background

In June 2016, staff presented the Board with a set of proposed fare policy changes and requested authorization to initiate a public input process. The public outreach process included:

- Two presentations to the Tri-Valley Accessible Advisory Committee (TAAC, formerly the Wheels Accessible Advisory Committee) and one to the Pleasanton Paratransit Task Force
- Presentations to Wheels and Rapid bus operators at their monthly Safety Meetings in August
- Flyers outlining the public input process posted on all Wheels, Rapid and Paratransit vehicles and at high ridership bus stops
- A brochure detailing the proposed changes and the public input process that was made available on all Wheels, Rapid and Paratransit vehicles
- Flyers and brochures distributed to the public libraries, Senior Centers and a number of senior housing complexes in Livermore, Pleasanton and Dublin
- Advertisements outlining the public input process that ran twice each in the Pleasanton Weekly and the Livermore Independent
- A news release sent to area media, resulting in stories in the Pleasanton Weekly and Livermore Independent.
- Social media outreach including posts multiple posts on Facebook, Twitter and Nextdoor as well as a post on Peachjar
- Public hearings in Dublin, Pleasanton and Livermore the week of September 10

Discussion

Public feedback was primarily received via email and the wheelsbus.com website. Eleven comments were received from those sources and are included as Attachment 1 to this document. There were no attendees at either the Dublin or Pleasanton public hearings and three people came to the Livermore public hearing. None of the public hearing attendees submitted formal comments, but instead chose to ask questions and receive responses.

The Tri-Valley Accessible Advisory Committee (TAAC) considered the proposed changes at their September 5 meeting. At the meeting, the committee reviewed the proposals and chose to take an action recommending adjustments to the staff proposal. The TAAC recommended adjustments are:

- Have the Senior and Disabled Monthly Pass increase from \$18 to \$22 in January, 2019, as originally proposed by staff, then increase from \$22 to \$25 in January, 2021 with no additional increase beyond that point
- Have the Dial-A-Ride fare increase from \$3.50 to \$3.75 in January 2019, as originally proposed by staff and delay the proposed increase to \$4.00 until January 2021, which leaves two years between the fare increases instead of one year that was proposed.

Based on the input received, Staff is proposing the following fare policy changes, which includes some modifications from the original proposal noted below:

Eliminate transfers and replace with Day Pass. Currently, upon depositing payment, LAVTA passengers receive a 2-hour window of unlimited boardings at no extra charge. This is primarily intended for transferring from one route to another, but may also be used for short roundtrip or trip-chaining purposes within the allotted time window.

The Day Pass is already available as a fare payment option for passengers using the Clipper Card and is priced at \$3.75 (\$1.75 senior/disabled/Medicare), which is less than the cost of two cash fares. Further, it applies automatically with the second boarding of the day and caps the daily fare at this amount. Staff's proposal would expand the access to the Day Pass, making it available for cash purchase at the farebox upon boarding, by issuing a magnetic-stripe card as fare medium for this purpose.

A number of comments were received requesting that the current \$1 credit available for passengers transferring from BART to Wheels and rapid buses be maintained for those using a Clipper Card. Staff supports this request, which is limited to Clipper Card transactions and not the paper transfers issued at BART Stations.

The amended staff recommendation is that the current free two-hour transfer be discontinued and that the current Clipper Day Pass option priced at \$3.75 (\$1.75 senior/disabled/Medicare) be extended to also be available with a cash purchase onboard at the farebox. In addition, passengers transferring from BART and using a Clipper Card for payment would continue to receive a \$1 credit towards their Wheels or Rapid fare.

Eliminate 10-ride tickets and replace with a Youth Clipper Card fare at the same rate. Currently, LAVTA sells its FareBuster-branded tickets in paper sheets of 10 tickets for \$16.00 for Adults and Youth. This fare type is popular with parents of students who ride to school because they can dispense them to their children on a day-to-day basis.

These tickets, however, cannot be accepted by the new fareboxes that the agency is deploying fleet-wide. As an interim solution, FareBuster tickets are collected manually into a pouch by the

bus driver, who then turns it in at the end of the shift. This procedure is not ideal from a loss prevention and fraud perspective and needs to be discontinued.

Given this, staff proposed to discontinue the 10-ride FareBuster paper ticket and replace it with a \$1.60 (value equivalent to each individual FareBuster ticket) youth fare. This discounted fare would be available only on Clipper, and the youth fare discount would not apply to any other fare category, such as cash, the Day Pass cap or the monthly pass. Youth Clipper Cards are available free of charge. During the Fall 2018 semester, LAVTA staff would work closely with area schools to assist students in the transition from FareBusters to Clipper Cards.

LAVTA also currently sells 10-ride tickets for Senior/Disabled/Medicare riders for \$10.00, which provides no discount compared to cash fare. It is proposed to discontinue selling these 10-ride tickets and encourage the transition to Clipper Card. Senior/Disabled Clipper Cards offer the incentive of the discounted Day Pass when two or more rides are taken in a day.

Several public comments were received regarding this proposal. Among the comments were the following points:

- For a person who bikes to work and rides the bus home, a discounted fare medium would no longer be available
- Eliminating the Farebusters and the \$1 BART credit would increase the daily commute rate from \$2.60 to \$3.75
- Support for the new Clipper Card Youth fare
- Concern over being able to use existing supplies of Farebusters
- A question regarding the impact of the proposed Paratransit Fare on the cost of 10 ride paratransit tickets

After considering these comments, staff still proposes that 10-ride tickets no longer be sold beginning December 31, 2018. A rider using Farebusters today rides round trip for \$3.20. With the Day Pass proposal, this daily cost would increase to \$3.75. However, given the fact that LAVTA has not had a fare increase since 2009, this increase does not seem excessive. Staff originally proposed that 10-ride tickets would continue to be accepted through December 2020 to allow riders the opportunity to use previously purchased tickets. Upon further consideration, one year seems to provide sufficient time for the use of outstanding inventory, so staff is now proposing that tickets continue to be accepted through December 31, 2019. Regarding the cost of Paratransit 10 ride tickets, the cost has always been the non-discounted cost of ten rides. That is proposed to continue.

Raise monthly senior/disabled pass price to 50% of the full-fare monthly pass. The monthly pass provides for unlimited rides on the buses of LAVTA and three of the other small East Bay-based operators of County Connection, WestCat, and Tri-Delta Transit. It is available as a flash pass by calendar month, as well as on the Clipper card for a rolling 31-day period that starts with the day of the first boarding.

Currently, the price for an unlimited-ride monthly regular Adult/Youth monthly pass is \$60.00, while the price for a Senior/Disabled/Medicare monthly pass is \$18.00 – a 70% discount over

the regular price. This differs from LAVTA's other fare options, where the Senior/Disabled/Medicare discount is 50%.

In order to bring the pricing of the Senior/Disabled/Medicare monthly pass in line with the agency's other fare types (and common industry practice), staff had originally proposed to gradually raise the price of the Senior/Disabled/Medicare monthly pass to 50% of the regular Adult/Youth pass using the annual steps as follows:

- Current - \$18.00
- Proposed January 1, 2019- \$22.00
- Proposed January 1, 2020 - \$26.00
- Proposed January 1, 2021 - \$30.00

This was one of the proposals that the TAAC recommended adjustments to the original staff recommendation, suggesting that the pass increase from \$18 to \$22 in January 2019, as originally proposed, then increase from \$22 to \$25 in January 2021 with no additional increase beyond that point. Given the concern over the financial impact of the original proposal to the affected riders, staff supports the TAAC's recommendation.

Raise the paratransit fare to be double that of the fixed-route fare. Due to its nature of on-demand, curb-to-curb service, the LAVTA paratransit service is expensive to provide. Whereas the average subsidy in FY2017 per fixed-route passenger was \$7.66, the corresponding number for paratransit was \$27.40. The current fare the LAVTA paratransit service is \$3.50.

As a recipient of Federal funds, LAVTA cannot impose an unlimited charge on its paratransit riders; the Federal rules allow a charge of up to double the amount of the full fixed-route fare. Based on the agency's current full fare of \$2.00 for fixed route, the paratransit fare cap would be \$4.00.

Given the high cost of providing the paratransit service, and to encourage the use of fixed routes, it is proposed that the paratransit fare be raised to \$4.00. Recognizing that many of the riders in this category are on fixed, limited incomes, it is proposed that this increase be implemented in two steps:

- Current - \$3.50
- Proposed January 1, 2019 - \$3.75
- Proposed January 1, 2020 - \$4.00

The TAAC also asked for adjustments to the original staff recommendation on this proposal. They suggested that the fare increase from \$3.50 to \$3.75 in January 2019, as originally proposed and that LAVTA delay the proposed increase to \$4.00 until January 2021, which leaves two years between the fare increases instead of one year that was proposed. Again, given the concern over the financial impact of the original proposal to the affected riders, staff supports the TAAC's recommendation.

The table below summarizes the results from the modeling in terms of impact to revenue and ridership of the final staff recommended fare policy modifications.

Staff Recommendation Annual Ridership and Revenue Impacts

	Change in Annual Ridership	Ridership Percent Change	Change in Annual Revenue	Revenue Percent Change
Eliminate Transfers and Add Day Pass (\$3.75)	-22,100	-1.3%	\$315,800	15.7%
Eliminate FareBuster Tickets and Add Day Pass	-21,300	-1.3%	\$62,700	3.1%
Modify Senior/Disabled Monthly Pass Price (\$22)	-4,500	-0.3%	\$8,400	0.4%
Modify Senior/Disabled Monthly Pass Price (\$25)	-7,900	-0.5%	\$14,000	0.7%
Paratransit Fare (\$4.00)	-1,200	-2.3%	\$27,100	11.7%
Year one impact: Eliminate Transfers, Add Day Pass (\$3.75/\$1.75), Eliminate FareBuster Tickets (except Youth), Modify Senior/Disabled Monthly Pass Price (\$22)	-51,000	-3.1%	\$280,200	14.0%
Full implementation impact: Eliminate Transfers, Add Day Pass (\$3.75/\$1.75), Eliminate FareBuster Tickets (except Youth), Modify Senior/Disabled Monthly Pass Price (\$25)	-54,300	-3.3%	\$292,200	14.6%

Note: In FY16, Wheels annual fixed-route ridership was 1,648,604, and passenger fare revenue was \$2,007,023.

While LAVTA is not required to complete a fare equity analysis of these proposed changes as a part of its Title VI plan, the recommended changes recommended do not appear to disproportionately impact or burden low-income or limited-English proficient populations. It is also important to note that all of the proposed fare policy changes have been reviewed by LAVTA’s Tri-Valley Accessible Advisory Committee (TAAC) and both of the TAAC recommended modifications to the original staff proposal have been incorporated into this final staff recommendation.

Next Steps

If approved by the Board, staff would begin an extensive public outreach campaign to educate our passengers on the upcoming changes.

Recommendation

Staff recommends the Projects and Services Committee forward the final staff proposed fare policy changes to the Board of Directors for consideration, and recommends that the Board approve these proposed changes with an implementation date of January 1, 2019.

Attachments:

1. Written Public Comments Received

Written Public Comments Received

Steven Dunbar (8/26/2018):

Hello Wheels Staff, I wanted to chime in and say I support the fare changes being proposed fare changes to Day Passes and elimination of paper transfers, having seen first-hand the issues they cause when people see that their transfer is not valid, frustrating both the driver and the rider. I also support it because it will hopefully reduce confusion about fares, leading to increases in service speed. I am all too aware of the tough balance between a service that serves seniors/ADA users, children, and tourists, while still providing the speed and convenience for commuters and just people trying to get from place to place. I would suggest that LAVTA tries to add very clear directions on Day Passes both directly on the farebox and at popular stops, such as BART and the outlets, with easy to understand instructions. (Ex: Heading somewhere and then back on the same line? Taking longer than x hours? Ask the driver for a day pass) I would hope that LAVTA makes it clear at the outreach hearings that electronic transfers are not being discontinued, and to also make it clear what facilities will be available to distribute Clipper cards to seniors or others with little internet access. Clipper is a great system that should be encouraged for all users, but there is an initial barrier in getting a card and then keeping it loaded for those who don't have frequent internet access. If Clipper services are not already offered at the Livermore Transit Station, I would suggest adding them there. I have no opinion on Monthly Passes and Dial-a-Ride fees other than to say that the per-passenger subsidy of Dial-a-Ride is worrying but largely outside of LAVTA's control. Increasing the fare is a band-aid. Thanks for listening, Steven Dunbar

Greg Lingenfelder (8/27/2018):

Hello, I ride the bus every work day on my way home. I commute by bicycle in the morning, and ride bus occasionally in morning. The monthly pass is not worth it for me. Fare Buster ticket sheet is my only option for discount off of normal fare. Please consider bicycle commuters and offer some kind of bulk buying discount that Fare Buster provides.

John Collins (9/5/2018):

I disagree with two of your plans. First, I am no longer working and so I don't know if the \$1 BART discount still applies to those who use BART for a return trip. If it still does, then your plan to eliminate the Fare Buster tickets for all adults and instead offer only a day pass will increase a round trip cost for BART commuters from \$2.60 to \$3.75. Eliminating Fare Buster tickets will be one more reason for BART commuters to cease using Wheels. I suggest that you offer the Fare Buster tickets on-line to add to ones Clipper card. Clipper offers BART ticket discounts for Clipper cards and I am certain that you too can arrange discounts with Clipper. Second, I recommend that you continue the use of transfers automatically for Clipper card users. I believe that it is unfair to those to whom you don't provide single bus service to charge almost a second fare simply because your system fails to provide a single bus route to their destination. You should charge one fare to all passengers to get to their destination. Your concern of fare evasion will not be possible for those who use Clipper and must use more than one bus simply to get anywhere within the LAVTA service area. Therefore, your reason for eliminating transfers will not be valid.

Lisa Adamos (9/5/2018):

To whom it may concern, With regard to implementing a reduced Youth fare discount using the Clipper Card from the current \$1.75/ride to \$1.60/ride, I am in full support. It would save parents time from having to go to Safeway to purchase the Farebuster tickets and allow for more convenience to add funds via the Clipper Card website. We would also save \$3/month with the additional discount using Clipper Card. Thank you, Lisa Adamos

Stephanie Wilson-Goure (9/8/2018):

I support the fare increase for Wheels. I worked for a transit agency and understand the need to increase fares particularly if there has been no fare increase since 2009. Thank you for this opportunity to comment.

Dan Rosler (9/11/2018):

Hi, I'd like to provide this input to your planning process. I use the Wheels bus service to get to and from BART for work and use both the 10-ride books (which I get through WageWorks to save on taxes) and the BART-to-bus transfer discount on my Clipper Card to help with total commute costs. I know from some discussion on Nextdoor.com that there are other professionals like me who do the exact same. So please consider that it's not only students who are using the 10-ride books. And if the concern about offering transfer discounts is because of fraud with the paper tickets, please continue to offer transfers when using Clipper Card -- for which there can be no fraud. Thank you, Dan

Forrest Brown (9/11/2018):

I have two concerns with the new, proposed policy changes.

1) "It is proposed that the use of paper transfers be eliminated".

How is it proposed to deal with that portion of the revenue customers who are on a strictly cash basis? I see a lot of people every day shoveling dimes or quarters into the fare box. They obviously prefer cash, for whatever reason, to a Clipper Card or a Day Pass Option. A significant number of the general bus rider population appear to be those who do not have a lot of spare cash for alternative options as proposed.

2) "It is proposed that Fare Busters and Senior/Disabled tickets be eliminated".

A) See comments above with regards to that portion of the population that have limited access to Clipper Cards and prefer to be on a strictly cash basis.

B) It is unclear what the proposed policy will be with regards to those of use that have purchased blocks of Fare Buster tickets in advance, as it were. Will my existing blocks of 40 tickets become invalid on some arbitrary date? Will I still be able to use up my existing stock of tickets, or will I lose the monetary value that the blocks of tickets represent? Will I be able to get a refund for the current value of the tickets? Perhaps as a credit to a Clipper Card, assuming that I have one, or will the invalidation of my current stock of tickets represent a taking of personal property?

Your assistance in these matters is appreciated. Forrest Brown

Lynda Kinnard 9/11/2018):

Since the fleet of new buses cannot accept Fare Buster tickets, it is obvious that the plan to eliminate them was in the works before the test bus was approved and buses ordered. So "asking the public" may really just be an act to ease your collective consciences.

I do not use Wheels daily, but when I do, see some of the people who depend on this service and rely on it every day. Especially the elderly and those with physical challenges. As most of them are dependent on social security and other financial services for their survival, the proposed increases will create hardship for many of them. They have no control over their income, so should not be penalized, even if your costs increase. Eliminate this part of your plan, or adjust it, so it remains affordable for those without other transportation options.

As to fraudulent use of the paper tickets; such as the FareBuster tickets; it was your choice to have fare boxes that do not accept them. You selected the bus design and now you are sugar-coating the need to cover the costs.

And, I do not recall seeing any mention of plans for safe and convenient places for your customers to obtain and upload money onto the Clipper cards that you are encouraging them to use. Are there plans to have a few indoor kiosks for those without internet access, and don't take BART?

Thank you for your time and consideration, Lynda Kinnard

Shannon Fogerty (9/12/2018):

Hi there I'm looking at the proposed fare change pamphlet and I am actually curious about one thing that wasn't mentioned in there. If everything else goes up with this passing and I just wanted to find out if the Dial-a-Ride tickets sheet of 10 would still stay at the same price or would that supposedly increase too? Just wanted to make sure that I didn't miss anything important stuff as well. Let me know when you find out the info for my question please and thanks again Shannon Fogarty

Dan Lee (9/14/2018):

Once you increase the fare bus 8 will no longer be anything of a value. I can take an Uber pool to and from work for about the same price and Uber pool isn't late EVERY SINGLE DAY. I mean seriously why is this bus late every day by more than 10 minutes. It's not even a long route.

Mary West (9/16/2018):

I take BART to Berkeley for my work and I take the 10 to get to my house downtown by using the transfer that is in the BART station that makes the total ride affordable. Thank you to please consider these transfers during your rate adjustments and help those taking public transportation by keeping discounted bus rides for those taking BART instead of driving to the parking garage. Thanks! Mary

AGENDA

ITEM 6



STAFF REPORT

SUBJECT: 2018 FTA Triennial Review
FROM: Tamara Edwards, Director of Finance
DATE: September 24, 2018

Action Requested

Review the 2018 FTA Triennial report.

Background

As required by federal statutes, every three years transit agencies who are recipients of federal financial assistance are reviewed with respect to their compliance with federal rules and regulations. LAVTA's Triennial review was recently completed and a final report was issued on August 22, 2018. The review covers the period 2015, 2016, and 2017.

Discussion

FTA's final report is attached to this staff paper, and fully describes the 20 areas of interest to the federal government, and their report of LAVTA's compliance in each area. Of the 20 areas, LAVTA was found to have no deficiencies in 19. FTA found deficiencies in one area, Satisfactory Continuing Control in regard to the agencies spare ratio.

For each finding, FTA has specified the date by which the deficiency must be remediated. Staff has already sent in our corrective action plan and it has been approved by FTA staff.

Attachment 1 provides the summarized findings and LAVTA's actions taken.

Federal regulations continually change in the transit industry and the Triennial is a good mechanism to ensure that LAVTA is aware of all the changes. The FTA and its reviewers were overall very pleased with LAVTA and the results of the review.

Budget

NA

Next Steps

LAVTA will work with the FTA to close out the one finding.

Recommendation

Review the 2018 FTA Triennial report.

Attachments:

1. Spare ratio resolution sent to the FTA
2. 2018 FTA Triennial Review – final report

LIVERMORE AMADOR VALLEY TRANSIT AUTHORITY

S T A F F R E P O R T

SUBJECT: Fleet Spare Ratio

FROM: David Massa, Senior Fleet & Technology Management Specialist

DATE: September 12, 2018

Background

During the 2018, the Federal Transit Administration's Triennial Audit of LAVTA's (herein referred to as the agency) fleet, it was deemed that the agency's spare ratio was too high.

In the second quarter of CY 2018, the agency fixed-route spare ratio stood at 22.45%.

Today

Current Federal Transit Administration guidance states that an agency's revenue vehicle spare ratio should not exceed 20% regardless of fleet size. If an agency has 60 buses they are allowed a 20% spare ratio. If an agency has 1000 buses they are allowed a 20% spare ratio.

The Agency's current spare ratio is just over 22%. Due to our very small fleet size the difference between a 20% and 22% spare ratio, in our case, amounts to 1 bus.

Action to Reduce the Spare Ratio

The following page displays the fleet reduction plan. Fleet levels are reassessed annually in order to determine the need to replace or not replace an asset based on projected service levels.

Fleet Retirement Plan by Vehicle Type through CY 2019 as of September 2018

Year/Model	Type	Quantity	Disposal CY	# of Planned Replacements	Active Fleet Size	Spare Ratio
2007 Gillig Hybrid	General Fixed Route	1	2019	0	59	20%

Through bus retirements, without replacements, the agency will be within the acceptable range of the spare ratio requirement. This assumes that the peak vehicle requirement remains steady at 49 vehicles. As stated previously, the number of peak vehicles required will be reassessed annually and the replacement schedule adjusted as necessary.

Summary

The agency is and has been actively reducing its active fleet size. We believe that our spare ratio will be within the acceptable range by the end of the calendar year 2019

FINAL REPORT

**FISCAL YEAR 2018
TRIENNIAL REVIEW**

of

**Livermore Amador Valley Transit Authority
(LAVTA)
Livermore, CA**

Recipient ID: 5296

Performed for:

**U.S. DEPARTMENT OF TRANSPORTATION
FEDERAL TRANSIT ADMINISTRATION
REGION IX**

Prepared By:

CDI/DCI Joint Venture

Scoping Meeting Date: February 23, 2018

Site Visit Date: July 10-12, 2018

Draft Report Date: July 26, 2018

Final Report Date: August 22, 2018

Table of Contents

I.	Executive Summary.....	1
II.	Review Process and Background.....	2
	1. Background.....	2
	2. Process.....	2
	3. Metrics.....	3
III.	Recipient Description.....	4
	1. Organization and Services.....	4
	2. Award and Project Activity.....	5
IV.	Results of the Review.....	7
	1. Legal.....	7
	2. Financial Management and Capacity.....	7
	3. Technical Capacity – Award Management.....	7
	4. Technical Capacity – Program Management and Subrecipient Oversight.....	7
	5. Technical Capacity – Project Management.....	7
	6. Satisfactory Continuing Control.....	8
	7. Maintenance.....	8
	8. Procurement.....	8
	9. Disadvantaged Business Enterprise.....	9
	10. Title VI.....	9
	11. Americans With Disabilities Act – General.....	9
	12. Americans With Disabilities Act – Complementary Paratransit.....	10
	13. Equal Employment Opportunity.....	10
	14. School Bus.....	10
	15. Charter Bus.....	10
	16. Drug-Free Workplace Act.....	11
	17. Drug and Alcohol Program.....	11
	18. Section 5307 Program Requirements.....	11
	19. Section 5310 Program Requirements.....	11
	20. Section 5311 Program Requirements.....	12
V.	Summary of Findings.....	13
VI.	Attendees Lists.....	15
VII.	Appendices.....	16

I. Executive Summary

This report documents the Federal Transit Administration’s (FTA) Triennial Review of the Livermore Amador Valley Transit Authority (LAVTA), in Livermore, California. The review was performed by CDI/DCI Joint Venture. During the site visit, administrative and statutory requirements were discussed, and documents were reviewed. LAVTA’s transit facility was toured to provide an overview of activities related to FTA-funded projects.

The Triennial Review focused on LAVTA’s compliance in 20 areas. A deficiency was found in the area listed below.

Review Area	Deficiencies	
	Code	Description
Satisfactory Continuing Control	SCC9-1	Excessive fixed-route bus spare ratio

II. Review Process and Background

1. Background

The United States Code, Chapter 53 of Title 49 (49 US.C. 5307(f) (2)) requires that “At least once every three years, the Secretary shall review and evaluate completely the performance of a grantee in carrying out its program, specifically referring to compliance with statutory and administrative requirements.”

The Triennial Review includes a review of the recipient’s compliance in 20 areas. The basic requirements for each of these areas are summarized in Section IV.

This report presents the findings from the Triennial Review of the Livermore Amador Valley Transit Authority. The review concentrated on procedures and practices employed during the past three years; however, coverage was extended to earlier periods as needed to assess the policies in place and the management of grants. The specific documents reviewed and referenced in this report are available at FTA’s regional office or the recipient’s office.

2. Process

The Triennial Review process includes a pre-review assessment, a review scoping meeting with the FTA regional office, and an onsite visit at the recipient’s location. A Recipient Information Request (RIR) package was sent to LAVTA advising it of the review and site visit containing a list of items and questions that the recipient was required to submit to the reviewer. The review scoping meeting was conducted with the Region IX Office on February 23, 2018. Additional files retained by the regional office were sent to the reviewer electronically. A Site Visit Agenda package was sent to LAVTA advising it of the site visit date and indicating information that would be needed and issues that would be discussed. The site visit to LAVTA occurred on July 10-12, 2018.

The onsite portion of the review began with an entrance conference, at which the purpose of the Triennial Review and the review process were discussed. The remaining time was spent discussing administrative and statutory requirements and reviewing documents. The reviewer visited LAVTA’s transit facility and Intermodal Station to provide an overview of activities related to FTA-funded projects.

The reviewer examined a sample of maintenance records for FTA-funded vehicles and equipment. Upon completion of the review, FTA and the reviewer provided a summary of preliminary findings to LAVTA at an exit conference. Section VI of this report lists the individuals participating in the review.

3. Metrics

The metrics used to evaluate whether a recipient is meeting the requirements for each of the areas reviewed are:

- *Not Deficient*: An area is considered not deficient if, during the review, no findings were noted with the grantee's implementation of the requirements.
- *Deficient*: An area is considered deficient if any of the requirements within the area reviewed were not met.
- *Not Applicable*: An area can be deemed not applicable if, after an initial assessment, the grantee does not conduct activities for which the requirements of the respective area would be applicable.

III. Recipient Description

1. Organization and Services

The Livermore Amador Valley Transit Authority (LAVTA) is a joint powers authority established in 1986. It provides transit service to the Tri-Valley area 39 miles east of San Francisco and 28 miles north of Silicon Valley, serving the cities of Livermore, Pleasanton, Dublin, and unincorporated areas of eastern Alameda County. LAVTA contracts with MV Transportation, Inc. for its Wheels fixed route service and with Medical Transportation Management (MTM) for complementary paratransit service. The population of LAVTA's service area is approximately 230,968. LAVTA operates a network of 28 fixed routes. Service is provided seven days per week from 4:34 a.m. to 1:36 a.m. Monday-Friday, and from approximately 5:34 a.m. to 1:36 a.m. Saturday and Sunday. LAVTA's complementary paratransit service, known as Dial-a-Ride, operates during the same days and hours of service as the fixed routes.

The basic adult fare for bus service is \$2.00. A reduced fare of \$1.00 is offered to seniors, persons with disabilities, and Medicare cardholders during all hours. The fare for Dial-a-Ride paratransit service is \$3.50. LAVTA offers monthly passes and discounted multi-ride ticket options.

LAVTA operates a fleet of 60 buses for fixed route service. Its bus fleet consists of standard and low floor 29, 35 and 40-foot transit coaches. The current peak requirements for 48 vehicles. LAVTA's spare ratio currently is 25%. The spare ratio decreased during the review period due to the agency following an FTA-approved fleet management plan to reduce its excessive fleet. The agency anticipates being in full compliance with the FTA mandated spare ratio by the end of calendar year 2019.

LAVTA operates from a single maintenance and administration facility at 1362 Rutan Court in Livermore. It maintains a bus storage, washing and fueling facility at 875 Atlantis Court. Service is oriented around a transit center at 2500 Railroad Avenue in downtown Livermore. All three facilities have an FTA interest.

The LAVTA's National Transit Database Report for fiscal year 2017 has been accepted by FTA.

2. Award and Project Activity

Below is LAVTA's open awards at the time of the review.

Award Number	Award Amount	Year Executed	Description
CA-2017-146	\$14,639,017	2017	Bus replacement, preventive maintenance
CA-2016-018	\$1,009,440	2016	Dublin Boulevard, Transit performance
CA-03-0801	\$10,930,000	2012	Bus Rapid Transit

Projects completed:

Purchase of 40 buses: 20 purchased in 2016, and 20 purchased in 2017. Includes a mix of 29', 35' and 40' heavy-duty buses.

Transit Performance Initiative (TPI) Project on Dublin Blvd: The project upgraded the traffic system to include adaptive signal technology to improve travel times, and three new bus queues jump lanes were installed. Additionally, the project brought a GTFS-Real time feed to the LAVTA bus system and now real time bus information is being made available on several phone apps.

Implementation of major fixed route restructuring in August 2016: A comprehensive operational analysis (Wheels Forward) was conducted in 2015/16 and recommendations were implemented in August 2016 to streamline routes, reduce duplicative routes/route segments, eliminate unproductive routes/route segments, improve bus stop spacing, and increase frequency along major BART feeder lines.

Resurfacing Rutan Parking Lot: A slurry seal was done on the Rutan Administration building parking lot in 2017, which also included several ADA upgrades.

On-going Projects:

LAVTA is upgrading the Transit Signal Priority on the fleet of Rapid buses and along the Rapid corridors (Locally Funded). The project will be upgrading the Transit Signal Priority (TSP) along the Rapid BRT lines from infrared to GPS-based and will expand TSP to new corridors in Pleasanton.

BRT Corridor Upgrade Project (North Canyons Federally Funded). The project will upgrade the bus stop amenities along the 30R line in Livermore to the Rapid branded-style including premium shelters, real time transit information, seating, bicycle storage, and lighting.

Go Dublin TNC Pilot -A pilot partnership with TNCs (uber, lyft, De Soto cab) was launched in January 2017. The pilot was developed through the Wheels Forward study. The pilot includes a discount of up to \$5 for rideshare trips taken within the City of Dublin.

Santa Rita Bus Stop Upgrade Project (Locally Funded). The project will upgrade the bus stop amenities along the 10R line in Pleasanton to the Rapid branded-style including premium shelters, real time transit information, seating, bicycle storage, and lighting.

Historic Depot Project -The City of Livermore is relocating a Historic Train Depot to the Livermore Transit Center, which is owned by LAVTA. The existing ticket building was demolished, a temporary ticket office has been constructed, and the Depot building has been moved and is currently under renovation.

Mobility Forward: Paratransit Assessment (Locally Funded). This study is examining ways to enhance efficiency and improve service delivery for paratransit service(s) throughout the Tri-Valley. Study recommendations are expected to be considered by the Board in Spring 2018, with implementation in Fiscal Year 2019.

Shared Autonomous Vehicle Pilot (Locally Funded). This project will involve testing a level 4 Shared Autonomous Vehicle (SAV) in the City of Dublin on public roads and connecting with a mass transit (BART) station.

Individualized Marketing (Federally Funded). This project, involving door-to-door travel training and marketing of Rapid services, was introduced along the 10R Santa Rita corridor in Spring 2017. This project will be expanded to the 30R Dublin Blvd corridor in Spring 2018.

Renovation of the Livermore Transit Center (Federally Funded). This project will provide necessary repairs to the Transit Center passenger waiting area, including repainting the shade structure, lighting and security improvements, new street furniture, and a repair of the asphalt in the drive aisle.

Future Projects:

Farebox Upgrade on the remaining fleet of buses (20).

Completion of the SAV test and expansion of the SAV program.

Upgrade of the non-revenue fleet.

Atlantis Facility Phase III and IV design.

IV. Results of the Review

1. Legal

Basic Requirement: The recipient must promptly notify the Federal Transit Administration (FTA) of legal matters and additionally notify the U.S. Department of Transportation (US DOT) Office of Inspector General (OIG) of any instances relating to false claims under the False Claims Act or fraud. Recipients must comply with restrictions on lobbying requirements.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Legal.

2. Financial Management and Capacity

Basic Requirement: The recipient must have financial policies and procedures; an organizational structure that defines, assigns and delegates authority; and financial management systems in place to match, manage, and charge only allowable cost to the award. The recipient must conduct required single audits and provide financial oversight of subrecipients.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Financial Management and Capacity.

3. Technical Capacity – Award Management

Basic Requirement: The recipient must report progress of projects in awards to the FTA timely.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Technical Capacity - Award Management.

4. Technical Capacity – Program Management and Subrecipient Oversight

Basic Requirement: The recipient must follow the public involvement process for transportation plans; develop and submit a State Management Plan to the FTA for approval; report in the Federal Funding Accountability and Transparency Act Subaward Reporting System (FSRS) on subawards; and ensure subrecipients comply with the terms of the award.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Technical Capacity – Program Management and Subrecipient Oversight.

5. Technical Capacity – Project Management

Basic Requirement: The recipient must be able to implement FTA-funded projects in accordance with the award application, FTA Master Agreement, and all applicable laws and regulations, using sound management practices; and prepare force account plans.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Technical Capacity – Project Management.

6. Satisfactory Continuing Control

Basic Requirement: The recipient must ensure that FTA-funded property will remain available to be used for its originally authorized purpose throughout its useful life until disposition.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, a deficiency was found with the FTA requirements for Satisfactory Continuing Control.

Deficiency: SCC9-1: Excessive fixed-route bus spare ratio

LAVTA's spare ratio is 25%. Currently, LAVTA is operating under an FTA-approved fleet management plan to reduce its excessive fleet. While the spare ratio has significantly decreased during the review period, it continues to exceed the FTA mandated spare ratio of 20%.

Corrective Action and Schedule: By October 16, 2018, the recipient must submit to the FTA regional office an updated plan for reducing the spare ratio to 20 percent for fleets of 50 or more buses or to what is reasonable for fleets under 50 buses. The plan should include a spreadsheet listing for each bus type, the number of buses, and, for each year until the spare ratio reaches 20 percent, the number of buses to be disposed of, the number of buses to be added, the projected peak requirement, and the projected spare ratio. The plan should include detailed justifications for years in which spare ratios exceed 20 percent. If the plan cannot be completed within 90 days, the recipient must notify FTA and begin reporting progress in quarterly/annual reports.

7. Maintenance

Basic Requirement: Recipients must keep federally funded vehicles, equipment, and facilities in good operating condition. Recipients must keep Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) accessibility features on all vehicles, equipment, and facilities in good operating order.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Maintenance.

8. Procurement

Basic Requirement:

States: When procuring property and services under a Federal award, a state must follow the same policies and procedures it uses for procurements from its non-Federal funds. The state will comply with 2 CFR §200.322 (*Procurement of Recovered Materials*) and ensure that every purchase order or other contract includes any clauses required by section 2 CFR §200.326 (*Contract Provisions*). All other non-Federal entities, including subrecipients of a state, will follow 2 CFR §§200.318 (*General Procurement Standards*) through 200.326 (*Contract Provisions*).

Non-state recipients: The non-Federal entity must use its own documented procurement procedures which reflect applicable State, local, and tribal laws and regulations, and conform to applicable Federal law and the standards identified in 2 CFR part 200.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Procurement.

9. Disadvantaged Business Enterprise

Basic Requirement: Recipients must comply with 49 CFR Part 26 to ensure nondiscrimination in the award and administration of US DOT-assisted contracts. Recipients also must create a level playing field on which Disadvantaged Business Enterprises (DBEs) can compete fairly for US DOT-assisted contracts.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the U.S. Department of Transportation (US DOT) requirements for Disadvantaged Business Enterprises (DBEs).

10. Title VI

Basic Requirement: The recipient must ensure that no person shall, on the grounds of race, color, or national origin, be excluded from participating in, or be denied the benefits of, or be subject to discrimination under any program or activity receiving Federal financial assistance without regard to whether specific projects or services are federally funded. The recipient must ensure that all transit services and related benefits are distributed in an equitable manner.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Title VI.

11. Americans With Disabilities Act – General

Basic Requirement: Titles II and III of the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 provide that no entity shall discriminate against an individual with a disability in connection with the provision of transportation service. The law sets forth specific requirements for vehicle and facility accessibility and the provision of service, including complementary paratransit service.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the U.S. Department of Transportation (US DOT) requirements for Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) - General.

12. Americans With Disabilities Act – Complementary Paratransit

Basic Requirement: Titles II and III of the Americans with Disabilities Act of 1990 provide that no entity shall discriminate against an individual with a disability in connection with the provision of transportation service. The law sets forth specific requirements for vehicle and facility accessibility and the provision of service, including complementary paratransit service.

Finding: During this Triennial of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the U.S. Department of Transportation requirements for Americans with Disabilities Act (ADA) - Complementary Paratransit.

13. Equal Employment Opportunity

Basic Requirement: The recipient must ensure that no person in the United States shall on the grounds of race, color, religion, national origin, sex, age, or disability, be excluded from participating in, or denied the benefits of, or be subject to discrimination in employment under any project, program, or activity receiving Federal financial assistance under the Federal transit laws. (Note: Equal Employment Opportunity Commission’s regulation only identifies/recognizes religion and not creed as one of the protected groups.)

This review area only applies to recipients that are required to submit a full or abbreviated EEO Program based on the number of its transit-related employees and whether it reaches a monetary threshold. Therefore, the requirements of this review area are not applicable to the review of LAVTA

14. School Bus

Basic Requirement: Recipients are prohibited from providing school bus service in competition with private school bus operators unless the service qualifies and is approved by the FTA Administrator under an allowable exemption. Federally funded equipment or facilities cannot be used to provide exclusive school bus service.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for School Bus.

15. Charter Bus

Basic Requirement: Recipients are prohibited from using federally funded equipment and facilities to provide charter service if a registered private charter operator expresses interest in providing the service. Recipients are allowed to operate community-based charter services excepted under the regulations.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Charter Bus.

16. Drug-Free Workplace Act

Basic Requirement: Recipients are required to maintain a drug-free workplace for all award-related employees; report any convictions occurring in the workplace timely; and have an ongoing drug-free awareness program.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Drug-Free Workplace Act.

17. Drug and Alcohol Program

Basic Requirement: Recipients receiving Section 5307, 5309, 5311, or 5339 funds that have safety-sensitive employees must have a drug and alcohol testing program in place for such employees.

Finding: During this Triennial Review of LAVTA, no deficiencies were found with the FTA requirements for Drug and Alcohol Program.

18. Section 5307 Program Requirements

Basic Requirements: For fixed-route service supported with Section 5307 assistance, fares charged seniors, persons with disabilities or an individual presenting a Medicare card during off peak hours will not be more than one half the peak hour fares.

Recipients are expected to have a written, locally developed process for soliciting and considering public comment before raising a fare or carrying out a major transportation service reduction.

Recipients shall develop, publish, afford an opportunity for a public hearing on, and submit for approval, a program of projects (POP).

Recipients must annually certify that they are spending at least one percent of such funds for transit security projects or that such expenditures for security systems are not necessary.

Recipients must ensure that least one percent of such funds are expended on associated transit enhancement projects.

LAVTA had no deficiencies in its 5307 program implementation.

19. Section 5310 Program Requirements

Basic Requirement: Recipients must expend funds on eligible projects that meet the specific needs of seniors and individuals with disabilities. Projects selected for funding under the Section 5310 program must be included in a locally developed, coordinated public transit-human services transportation plan. Recipients must approve all leases of Section 5310-funded vehicles and ensure that leases include required terms and conditions. Either the recipient or subrecipient must hold title to the leased vehicles.

This review area only applies to recipients that receive Section 5310 funds; therefore, the requirements of this review area are not applicable to the review of LAVTA.

20. Section 5311 Program Requirements

Basic Requirement: Recipients must expend funds on eligible projects to support rural public transportation services and intercity bus transportation.

This review area only applies to recipients that receive Section 5311 funds; therefore, the requirements of this review area are not applicable to the review of LAVTA.

V. Summary of Findings

Review Area	Deficiencies		Corrective Action	Response Due Date	Date Closed
	Code	Description			
1. Legal	ND				
2. Financial Management and Capacity	ND				
3. Technical Capacity Award Management	ND				
4. Technical Capacity Program Management and Subrecipient Oversight	ND				
5. Technical Capacity Project Management	ND				
6. Satisfactory Continuing Control	D	SCC9-1: Excessive fixed-route bus spare ratio	The recipient must submit to the FTA regional office a plan for reducing the spare ratio to 20 percent for fleets of 50 or more buses or to what is reasonable for fleets under 50 buses. The plan should include a spreadsheet listing for each bus type, the number of buses, and, for each year until the spare ratio reaches 20 percent, the number of buses to be disposed of, the number of buses to be added, the projected peak requirement, and the projected spare ratio. The plan should include detailed justifications for years in which spare ratios exceed 20 percent. If the plan cannot be completed within 90 days, the recipient must notify FTA and begin reporting progress in quarterly/annual reports.	October 16, 2018	
7. Maintenance	ND				
8. Procurement	ND				
9. Disadvantaged Business Enterprise (DBE)	ND				
10. Title VI	ND				

Review Area	Deficiencies		Corrective Action	Response Due Date	Date Closed
	Code	Description			
11. Americans With Disabilities Act (ADA) - General	ND				
12. Americans With Disabilities Act (ADA) Complementary Paratransit	ND				
13. Equal Employment Opportunity (EEO)	NA				
14. School Bus	ND				
15. Charter Bus	ND				
16. Drug-Free Workplace Act	ND				
17. Drug and Alcohol Policy	ND				
18. Section 5307 Program Requirements	ND				
19. Section 5310 Program Requirements	NA				
20. Section 5311 Program Requirements	NA				

VI. Attendees List

Name	Title	Phone Number	E-mail Address
<i>Livermore Amador Valley Transit Authority</i>			
Michael Tree	Executive Director	925-455-7564	mtree@lavta.org
Tamara Edwards	Director of Finance	925-455-7566	tedwards@lavta.org
Dave Massa	Fleet Mgr. ITS	925-455-7568	dmassa@lavta.org
Jennifer Yeamans	Sr. Grants Mgmt Specialist	925-455-7561	jyeamans@lavta.org
Tony McCaulay	Director of Planning & Marketing	925-455-7553	tmccaulay@lavta.org
Cyrus Shelk	Sr. Transit Planner	925-455-7555	cshelk@lavta.org
Kadri Kulm	Paratransit Planner	925-455-7575	kkulm@lavta.org
<i>MTM</i>			
Cheryl Wells	General Manager	510-541-6644	chwells@mtm-inc.net
Scott Transue	Region Vice President	619-734-5842	stransue@ride-right.net
Thomas Greufe	Director of Safety Administration	602-758-2303	tgreufe@ride-right.net
<i>MV Transit</i>			
Christian Pereira	General Manager	925-455-7518	christian.pereira@mvtransit.com
Antonio Berastain	Maintenance Manager	925-455-7521	aberastain@mvtransit.com
Carol (DJ) Jackson	Facility Maintenance Supervisor	925-455-7528	carol.jackson@mvtransit.com
Karen Gaskin	Safety Supervisor	925-455-7514	Karen.gaskin@mvtransit.com
<i>FTA</i>			
Audrey Bredehoft	Director, Office of Financial Management and Program Oversight	415-734-9453	audrey.bredehoft@dot.gov
Lynette Little	Regional Civil Rights Officer for Region IX	415-734-9464	lynette.little@dot.gov
Marisa Appleton	Civil Rights Officer for Oversight	312-705-1270	marisa.appleton@dot.gov
Roxana Hernandez	Transportation Program Specialist	415-734-9461	roxana.hernandez@dot.gov
<i>CDI/DCI Joint Venture</i>			
Louise Carter	Reviewer	312 303-3011	lcarter91@ameritech.net

VII. Appendices

No appendices included in this report.

AGENDA

ITEM 7



FY2019 Goals, Strategies and Projects

Last Updated – September 20, 2018

MANAGEMENT ACTION PLAN (MAP)

Goal: Service Development						
Strategies (those highlighted in bold indicate highest Board priority)						
<ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Provide routes and services to meet current and future demand for timely/reliable transit service 2. Increase accessibility to community, services, senior centers, medical facilities and jobs 3. Optimize existing routes/services to increase productivity and response to MTC projects and studies 4. Improve connectivity with regional transit systems and participate in Valley Link Project 5. Explore innovative fare policies and pricing options 6. Provide routes and services to promote mode shift from personal car to public transit 						
Projects	Action Required	Staff	Board Committee	Target Date	Status	Task Done
Strategic Plan/Long Range Transit Plan (Agency's 30 Year Plan)	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • RFP • Award of Contract • Consideration of Changes 	DP	Projects/ Services	Nov 2018 Feb 2019 May 2019	→ New project for Spring 2019.	
Review of Fixed Routes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • RFP • Award of Contract • Consideration of Changes 	DP	Projects/ Services	Nov 2018 Feb 2019 May 2019	→ It's been 24 months since the Wheels fixed route system redesign. This project will review the performance of the system since the redesign and recommend changes. New project for Spring 2019.	

<i>Projects</i>	<i>Action Required</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Board Committee</i>	<i>Target Date</i>	<i>Status</i>	<i>Task Done</i>
Comprehensive Paratransit Assessment	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Award of Contract • Public Outreach • Approval of Recommendations 	ED	Projects/ Services	Nov 2016 Jun/Nov 2017 Feb 2019	→ Nelson/Nygaard awarded contract. Public meetings held in June. LAVTA Board presentation made in September. Second round of workshops completed in November. City of Pleasanton analyzing data with near future meeting set on May 11th. City cancelled meeting. Awaiting new date to meet from City.	X X
Fare Study	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Draft Fare Study • Public Hearings • Board Approval 	PD	Projects/ Services	May 2017 Sept 2018 Oct 2018	→ Draft Fare Study for fixed route complete. F&A reviewed in May. Decision made to hold study results to see ridership trends on fixed route and paratransit study fare recommendations. <u>Public Hearings held in September. Board to consider in October.</u>	X
Hacienda Pass	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review Pass Program • Work with Hacienda on Improving the Program 	ED	Finance/ Admin	Oct 2018 Jun 2018	→ New Project	
Transit Signal Priority Upgrade Project in Rapid Corridors	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Engineering Work • Finish Project 	DP	Projects/ Services	Oct 2017 Mar 2019	→ Grant by TVTAC approved. Board approved MOU with Pleasanton. Board approved engineering contract with Kimley Horn. Design completed and submitted to Cities for review. Equipment purchase in Nov and install in Feb/March.	

Projects	Action Required	Staff	Board Committee	Target Date	Status	Task Done
Go Dublin Discount Program	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Explore use of Uber WAV • Secure additional funding • Develop long-term strategy 	ED	Projects/ Services	Nov 2018 Jun 2019 Jun 2019	→ Program continuing into FY2019. Contact made with Uber & MV to discuss Uber WAV in Dublin (MV provides wheelchair accessible rides through Uber). City of Dublin to provide funding for FY2019. Looking to obtain additional funding sources. City of Livermore contemplating their own Go Dublin type program.	
Dublin Service Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Explore use of articulated buses 	DP	Projects/ Services	Nov 2018	→ Nelson/Nygaard looking at merits of LAVTA operating articulated buses.	
SAV Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complete storage facility/electrical • Work through first set of tests • Seek long-term funding for project 	CM	Projects/ Services	Nov 2018 Jun 2019 Jun 2019	→ BART working on storage and electrical. Regular monthly meetings scheduled w/Project Partners. Working on 12-month work plan. <u>Met with Transdev to consider project management alternatives and future sand box FTA grant for project.</u>	
Advanced Intelligent Intersection Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Install equipment on buses • Evaluate performance of project 	CM	Projects/ Services	Jun 2019 Jun 2020	→ City of Dublin funded. Working with City and MTC on scope of work and procurement of equipment. <u>MOU approved by LAVTA and City.</u>	
Install and Upgrade Video System on Vehicles	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Install video cameras on paratransit vehicles • Upgrade 20 video systems on Wheels buses 	ED	Projects/ Services	Mar 2019 Jun 2019	→ Staff evaluating cameras/video systems for paratransit vehicles. → <u>Board awarded cameras/video systems for 20 buses in September.</u>	

<i>Projects</i>	<i>Action Required</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Board Committee</i>	<i>Target Date</i>	<i>Status</i>	<i>Task Done</i>
-----------------	------------------------	--------------	------------------------	--------------------	---------------	------------------

Goal: Marketing and Public Awareness

Strategies (those highlighted in bold indicate highest Board priority)

- 1. Continue to build the Wheels brand image, identity and value for customers**
2. Improve the public image and awareness of Wheels
3. Increase two-way communication between Wheels and its customers
- 4. Increase ridership, particularly on the Rapid, to fully attain benefits achieved through optimum utilization of our transit system**
5. Promote Wheels to New Businesses and residents

<i>Projects</i>	<i>Action Required</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Board Committee</i>	<i>Target Date</i>	<i>Status</i>	<i>Task Done</i>
Website Upgrades	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • More fully develop Better Way to BART section of website 	PD	Projects/ Services	Mar 2018	→ Board considering creative design/marketing contract in October.	
App Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Mobile Ticketing App • Improve integration on CityMapper • Mobile Ticketing in Transit and CityMapper 	PD	Projects/ Services	Feb 2019	→ Working with City Mapper and Transit apps on requirements for integration of mobile ticketing. Creating RFP for mobile ticketing.	
LAVTA Rebranding Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Bus stop sign replacement with new branding. 	PD	Projects/ Services	Jun 2019	→ Replace bus stop signs throughout service area with newly branded bus stop signs. Replace stencil stops with bus stop signs.	

Projects	Action Required	Staff	Board Committee	Target Date	Status	Task Done
Individualized Marketing	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Award Contract • Marketing • Review of Results 	PD	Projects/ Services	Jan 2019 May 2019 Jun 2019	→ Targeting Pleasanton high density housing areas along Rapid near BART.	
N Canyons Parkway Rapid Bus Stop Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Begin planning/engineering work • Improvements to site • Relocation of shelters 	FD	Projects/ Services	May 2017 Jun 2018 Aug 2018	→ FTA grant to upgrade stops in this corridor to Rapid style. Engineering work done. Bids came in high. Board rejected all bids. Bid re-advertised. Board awarded project in November. Construction completed.	X X X
Pleasanton SmartTrips Corridor Rapid Bus Stop Project	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Engineering work • Award of construction contract • Finish project 	FD	Projects/ Services	Nov 2017 Apr 2018 Jun 2018	→ ACTC grant received to upgrade stops in this corridor to Rapid style. Board awarded engineering to Kimley Horn in November. Bus shelter type is next step. Project award in April. 35% design completed. <u>65% design completed. Awaiting approval by City.</u>	
Replace Shelters Past Useful Life That Are On Livermore Routes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Identify shelters • Install 	FD	Projects/ Services	Nov 2016 Apr 2018	→ Shelters identified. 10 shelters delivered. No bids for install received. Rebid. Board approved contract with Hammercraft Construction in March. Negotiating task order for work.	X

<i>Projects</i>	<i>Action Required</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Board Committee</i>	<i>Target Date</i>	<i>Status</i>	<i>Task Done</i>
-----------------	------------------------	--------------	------------------------	--------------------	---------------	------------------

Goal: Community and Economic Development

Strategies (those highlighted in bold indicate highest Board priority)

1. Integrate transit into local economic development plans
2. Advocate for increased TOD from member agencies and MTC
- 3. Partner with employers in the use of transit to meet TDM goals & requirements**

<i>Projects</i>	<i>Action Required</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Board Committee</i>	<i>Target Date</i>	<i>Status</i>	<i>Task Done</i>
TMA Development in Dublin	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Develop guidelines in partnership with City of Dublin 	PD	Finance Admin	Oct 2019	→ Working with TMAs to draft program and agreements for City of Dublin to consider	
TOD Development	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Assist City in creating a master plan for the area around transit center in City of Livermore 	PD	Project/ Services	Jun 2018	→ After finishing Historic Depot project staff will schedule a meeting to continue discussions with City staff on this future project.	

Goal: Regional Leadership

Strategies (those highlighted in bold indicate highest Board priority)

- 1. Advocate for local, regional, state, and federal policies that support mission of Wheels**
2. Support staff involvement in leadership roles representing regional, state, and federal forums
3. Promote transit priority initiatives with member agencies
4. Support regional initiatives that support mobility convenience

<i>Projects</i>	<i>Action Required</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Board Committee</i>	<i>Target Date</i>	<i>Status</i>	<i>Task Done</i>
Valley Link	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> Provide staff support 	ED	Projects/ Services	Jun 2019	→ Staff continuing to provide support. Agency working on Phase II of Feasibility Report and environmental work/30% design of Valley Link. <u>MTC considering \$10.1M request in September. Caltrans working on Notice to Proceed for Phase II of Feasibility Report.</u>	

<i>Projects</i>	<i>Action Required</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Board Committee</i>	<i>Target Date</i>	<i>Status</i>	<i>Task Done</i>
Dublin Parking Garage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Provide staff support in administering the grant • Provide support for evaluation of bus circulation near project for inter-regional connections 	ED	Projects/ Services	Jun 2019	→ Staff meeting with County and Caltrans and CalSTA to support the project.	
Calendar Year Legislative Plan	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Creation of Legislative Plan and review/approval by the Board and provide support for key legislation. 	ED	Finance/ Admin	Feb 2018	→ F&A committee looked at draft legislative plan in January 2018. Board approved 2018 Legislative Plan in February. <u>Session concluding. Report to be made to Board. Prop 6 watch.</u>	

Goal: Organizational Effectiveness

Strategies (those highlighted in bold indicate highest Board priority)

1. Promote system wide continuous quality improvement initiatives
2. Continue to expand the partnership with contract staff to strengthen teamwork and morale and enhance the quality of service
- 3. Establish performance based metrics with action plans for improvement; monitor, improve, and report on-time performance and productivity**
4. HR development with focus on employee quality of life and strengthening of technical resources
5. Enhance and improve organizational structures, processes and procedures to increase system effectiveness
6. Develop policies that hold Board and staff accountable, providing clear direction through sound policy making decisions

<i>Projects</i>	<i>Action Required</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Board Committee</i>	<i>Target Date</i>	<i>Status</i>	<i>Task Done</i>
ViewPoint Software	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Staff to complete development of software w/Trapeze. 	ED	Projects/ Services	Mar 2019	→ Met with Trapeze. Dashboard for software to be installed/functional by October 31, 2018.	

<i>Projects</i>	<i>Action Required</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Board Committee</i>	<i>Target Date</i>	<i>Status</i>	<i>Task Done</i>
Contract Management	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Implement quarterly and annual contractor audits • Develop staff field observation reports and process • Implement regular reviews of system performance 	ED	Projects/ Services	Sept 2018 Oct 2018 Oct 2018	→ New project for Contract Compliance Manager. Audits and reports and review procedures under development. <u>Quarterly random audits being performed.</u>	X
Explore Quality of Life Opportunities for Workforce	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Explore opportunities to enhance quality of life to retain workforce 	FD	Finance/ Admin	Feb 2019	→ New project. Report to be made to the Board in February for implementation.	
Continue Planning of Atlantis Operating & Maintenance Facility	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Review previous conceptual planning and recommendations. 	FD	Finance/ Admin	Apr 2019	→ Currently LAVTA is out of office space/bus parking space. Review of plans to take place in late fall early spring for recommendations to the Board in April.	
<p>Goal: Financial Management</p> <p>Strategies (those highlighted in bold indicate highest Board priority)</p> <ol style="list-style-type: none"> 1. Develop budget in accordance with strategic Plan, integrating fiscal review processes into all decisions 2. Explore and develop revenue generating opportunities 3. Maintain fiscally responsible long range capital and operating plans 						
<i>Projects</i>	<i>Action Required</i>	<i>Staff</i>	<i>Board Committee</i>	<i>Target Date</i>	<i>Status</i>	<i>Task Done</i>
FY18 Comprehensive Annual Financial Report	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> • Complete financial audit and all required reporting to Board, local, regional and state agencies. 	DF	Finance/ Admin	Nov 2018	→ <u>Audit performed.</u> Review of audit at F&A in October and presentation to LAVTA Board in November.	

AGENDA

ITEM 8



LAVTA COMMITTEE ITEMS - September 2018 - January 2019

Projects & Services Committee

September

	Action	Info
Minutes	X	
FTA Triennial Review (last in '15)		X
Fare Policy Final Recommendation	X	

October

	Action	Info
Minutes	X	

November

	Action	Info
Minutes	X	
Quarterly Operations		X
Mobility Forward Draft Recommendation	X	
DAR Customer Satisfaction Survey		X

December

	Action	Info
Minutes	X	
*Typically December committee meetings are cancelled		

January

	Action	Info
Minutes (November)	X	
DAR Customer Satisfaction Survey		X
Mobility Forward Final Recommendation	X	